

# Dualism-2

Ranjan K. Panda

# I or the self

- Thinking – thought and thought alone cannot be taken away from me.
- I am, I exist
- If I completely stopped thinking, I would completely cease to exist.
- ***I am a thinking thing.***
  - Doubts, understands, affirms, desires, wills, refuses and also senses the mental images.

# Reality of the self

- ***I refers*** to a mind, soul, understanding, or reason.
- *I know that I am real*
- *None of these physical thing exists till I am something.*
- *I as the self*
- *Has the ability to sense – represent my sensations, feelings, thoughts, ideas, etc.*

# Am I not dreaming now?

- I seem to **see**...
- This seeming cannot be unreal, what is properly called sensing...
- *Sensing is just thinking*...
- How distinctly this is sensed?

# Example of Wax

- The ability to comprehend things distinctly.
- **Wax from honeycomb**
- After **heating** the wax
- Carefully attending to the change of features ... see what is being left.
- ***Extension*** – essential feature of the body.

# Mental inspection can be at once imperfect and confused

- Mind is prone to error
- “Even when I think to myself non-verbally, language stands in my way, and common usage close to deceiving me.”
- Looking and knowing things through pure eye-sight
- Knowing through mental inspection
- “Thus I comprehend my judgment, which is in my mind, objects that I once believed myself to see with my eyes.”

# Substance Dualism

- Mind and Body are two substances and independent of one another
- Their predicates are different
- They cannot be reducible to one another

# Platonism in Descartes Revisited

- The mind is accidentally lodged in the body
- God by his omnipotence can separate the mind and the body.



# Necessity of the mind

- Mind as an **epistemic** subject is presupposed and its **metaphysics** is also emphasized
- Epistemic subject
  - Representation of sensory perception, feeling and source of information
- Metaphysics of the mind
  - The role of moral agency and to mastery of passions

# Is there an union?

- Union covers important features of human experiences and action – voluntary action
- Knowledge of this union is conceivable through introspection

# Introspection

- Privileged Epistemic Access
- Mind is something inner and cannot be accessed from the outside world
- Occurrences of thoughts are immediately perceived.
- Knowledge of this – immediate and indubitable.
- Indubitability is restricted to my awareness (being actively in that state)
  - Epistemological transparency
  - Willing, understanding, etc.

# Pure Mind and Embodied Mind

- Soul/ mind is entirely distinct from the body
- I/ self represented by real human being
- Essence of mind – modes of thinking / power of imagination
- Through imagination and reason the self grasps the nature of real and accidental properties

# Contin...

- “The union is not matter of clear or distinct intellectual perception, but a brute fact of experience, something that our nature is said to teach us.”
- The union between mind and the body constitute human nature
  - E.g. feeling of pain, when the body is hurt
  - My body needs drink or food, etc.

# Gilbert Ryle's "Descartes' Myth"

- Official theory
  - Mind and body are harnessed together, but mind continues to exist after the death of the body
- Bodies are in space and subject to mechanical laws
  - External, publicly observable
- The mind is not in space,
  - private – direct cognizance of mind is possible

# The Metaphorical Division

- Mind and body are metaphorically divided

# Questions

- How can the mental events will be part of physical events?
- How does body influence the mind and vice-versa?
- How can we be entirely blind and deaf about the working of others' mind?
- Is there something hidden?
- How does one talk about authenticity?



# The Dogma of Ghost in the Machine

- The substance dualism is
- Category Mistake
- Eg. *A foreigner visiting University*
  
- “It has then to be explained to him that the University is not another collateral institution, some ulterior counterpart to the colleges, laboratories and offices which he has seen. The university is just the way in which all that he has already seen is organized.” (P.18)

# Origin of Category Mistake - 1

- Descartes discomfort with Galileo's mechanical theory of the universe .
- Descartes showed that there is something beyond the mechanical function of the universe.
  - For Ryle, **Descartes** was religious and moral person and **Hobbes** was not committed to any religious understanding of the world.

# Origin of the Category Mistake - 2

- The mind must be governed by non-mechanical laws
- How to reconcile the freedom of will with the deterministic world view of mechanics?